

(Draft)

Conference in Bangalore 2011

15th Sep.2011 at CSCS

“Comparative Aspects on Culture and Religion: India, Russia, China”

Christian Music in India As Intermediary Actors in the Contact Zone

Takako Inoue
Daito Bunka University

1. Introduction: Comparative Study of Musical Tradition

It is methodologically difficult how we can carry out the proper comparative study of diverse musical traditions of India, China and Russia. I have been thinking over this problem these 3 years in this project, “Comparative Research on Major Regional Powers in Eurasia”. We should not adapt the method of comparative musicology of the early 20th century when Western musicologists analyzed non-Western music by adapting the musical theory of European classical music which they regarded as something higher or something universal. It does not make sense to say that musical tradition of India is like this, that of China is …, and that of Russia is …. While I was in pursuit of common musical experiences of these three countries, I assumed that their experiences of the encounter with Western music might be a key factor.

Bruno Nettl, a famous ethnomusicologist says on the first encounter with Western music that Christian missionaries, soldiers and diplomats are important in introducing Western music to Non-Western countries (Nettl 1985). Christian hymns and military band music were learnt by native people converted or hired by European settlers. The Western impact on music culture of these three countries can also be studied properly in this point of view, however it is doubtless that their experiences are quite diverse according to what happened in their first encounter, how they approached to a new cultural phenomenon, what perception of Western music was constructed, and how they identified their own musical tradition being differentiated from Western music.

From the late 18th century to the early 20th century, the Western impact on music of India, Russia, and China is prominently visible and substantially significant for the relationship with their own musical tradition. This period is characterized by the Europe’s expansion: the Age of Colonialism and Imperialism. In my previous two papers

“The Reception of Western Music in South India around 1800” (Inoue 2010a) and “Interactions between Missionaries and Native Christians on Music in South India: Constructing Hindu-Christian Identity” (Inoue 2010b), I focused on the reception of Western music in south India and the role of native Christians in this process by taking up some examples of the 18th and 19th centuries.

In this paper, I will concentrate on proposing the methodological approach of comparative study. I suggest that the reception of Western music and the role of Christianity should be described as an intermediary actor, which transmits diverse cultures from one to the other and modifies them by various ways of this process, for the comparative study of diverse musical traditions. It is also important to refer “contact zone” defined by Mary Louise Pratt as “social spaces where cultures meet, clash, and grapple with each other, often in contexts of highly asymmetrical relations of power, such as colonialism, slavery, or their aftermaths as they are lived out in many parts of the world today.” (Pratt 1991) The intermediary actor in the contact zone should be considered in this paper. For this purpose, I will briefly discuss two other countries, Russia and China before discussing on the Christian music in Indian. Then I will proceed to describe how musical culture of India has been transformed by their contact with Christian missionaries.

2. The Western Impact on Music of Russia

Broadly speaking, Russia’s attitude to European classical music seems to be the most ambivalent among these three, since Russia has a history of classical music innovation. Until the 19th century, Russian art music had been dominated by foreign musicians. Peter I the Great (Pyotr Alexeyevich Romanov, 1672-1725, reign: 1689–1725) had begun this trend by importing foreign musicians to modernize his kingdom. Russian imperial court attracted many prominent musicians from Europe, particularly from Italy. A number of Russian composers received training there and composed choral music, operas, chamber works, and symphonic works. As a result, Russian compositions in the European classical music tradition exist though these compositions had never attracted the European audience. Thus Russia remains as a periphery of the European classical music tradition till the 18th century in its conventional history despite the effort of “Westernization” carried by the Imperial court as an official policy.

The first famous Russian composer who attracted the wide European audience was Mikhail Glinka (1804-1857), who exploited native Russian music traditions into the realm of European classical music and composed the early Russian language operas

such as *Ivan Susanin* and *Ruslan and Lyudmila*. They gained fame for relying on distinctively Russian tunes and themes. He is said to be the first Russian composer of musical nationalism, a musical phenomenon emerging as a part of the Romantic era. It initially began as a reaction against the dominance of the mainstream European classical tradition (German, Italian, and French music) and later developed alongside the growing nationalist movements being spread over the non-European regions.

Thereafter Russian folk music became the primary source for the younger generation composers. A group that called the Mighty Five, headed by Balakirev (1837–1910) and including Rimsky-Korsakov (1844–1908), Mussorgsky (1839–81), Borodin (1833–87) and César Cui (1835–1918), proclaimed its purpose to compose and popularize Russian national traditions in classical music. Many of the works by Glinka and the Mighty Five were based on Russian history, folk tales and literature, and are regarded as masterpieces of romantic nationalism in music. The reason why their compositions attracted the European audience is that they sounded new to the European ears and that they were composed in using different elements from the mainstream classical music.

It is important to point out that the Russian Musical Society (RMS) founded in 1859, led by composer-pianists Anton (1829–94) and Nikolay Rubinstein (1835–81). It is usually described as a period of the two rival groups, the Mighty Five embracing their Russian national identity and the RMS being musically more conservative. The RMS founded Russia's first Conservatories in St Petersburg and in Moscow and trained Peter Ilyich Tchaikovsky (1840–93) who remains Russia's best-known composer outside Russia with his successor, Sergey Rakhmaninov (1873–1943). It appeared like a kind of cultural conflict between Westernization and Nationalization, however, it is better understood that the European attention on Russian composers is a kind of fashion brought by Glinka's entrance into the European mainstream scene. Both music of the RMS's line and that of the Mighty Five are composed on the basis of romantic musical texture and appropriating national elements is a typical phenomenon in the part of romantic era as a mean of expressing the originality of composers.

The late 19th and early 20th century is characterized by the third wave of Russian classics led by Igor Stravinsky (1882–1971), Alexander Scriabin (1872–1915), Sergei Prokofiev (1891–1953) and Dmitri Shostakovich (1906–1975). They were experimental in style and musical language. Some of them emigrated after Russian revolution though Prokofiev eventually returned and contributed to Soviet music as well. The romance songs also became very popular. Singers of romances usually sang in operas and composed music and wrote the lyrics. They might have faced another positionality

transformed from which the previous identity had to be constructed in between Russia and West into which the new one should be constructed among Russia, Soviet, and West, that might be regarded as a struggle between universality and originality in other words.

What musical elements are more Russian and non-European? Can music expressions of Russian identity be constructed in between Europe and Asia, or in between non-European and non-Asian? Basically folk music and music of the Russian Orthodox liturgy are regarded as Russian and excluded from the above-mentioned history of classical music innovation. Nevertheless, composers belonging to the RMS also left not only secular music but also Russian Orthodox choir. Official acceptance of Christianity in Russia and the establishment of Russian Orthodox date back to 988, when Vladimir I of Kiev officially adopted Byzantine Rite. Music of Russian Orthodox choir, however, seems to be more westernized than Byzantine music though they share the characteristic of a cappella choir. The former is polyphonic and the latter is monophonic with drone whose texture is much similar to those of “Orient”: ex. India. Thus the history of Russian music cannot be described without referring to ambivalent relations with European classical music.

3. The Western Impact on Music of China

The history of Western music in China is said to begin with the encounter with Jesuit missionaries in the 16th century (Kraus 1989: 4, Melvin et al. 2004: 45-64). By then, there had been no reliable information about any practicing Christians remaining in China though there were several records referring Christians. In the 7th century, Nestorian Church (Church of the East) entered into China and was allowed to establish a place for worship in Xian, the capital city of the Tang Dynasty¹. As Emperor Wuzong (reigned 840–846) suppressed all foreign religions, Christianity declined rapidly. In the 13th century when the Yuan Dynasty of Mongols started, Christianity was a major influence under the rule of Mongols. But the next Ming Dynasty again rejected all foreign influences and adopted Confucian ideology. The competition with the Roman Catholic and Islam were also factors that Nestorian Church disappeared in China.

The first European to reach China with a musical instrument was Matteo Ricci (1552-1610) who presented a clavichord (harpsichord)² to Wanli Emperor (1563-1620)

¹ But there is another view that the first religious contacts between Christianity and China in the 1st century AD.

² Kraus says it was a harpsichord and Melvin says it was a clavichord.

of the Ming Dynasty in 1601, and trained four eunuchs attached to the Imperial court to play it. Jesuit missionaries had been active not only in their mission but also in the field of music till the Chinese Rites controversy, a dispute within the Roman Catholic Church, in the early 18th century. It was about whether Chinese folk religious rites and offerings to the Emperor constituted idolatry, that was raised mainly by Dominicans. Pope Clement XI decided in favor of Dominicans, which greatly reduced Catholic missionary activity in China³.

It is quite important to refer to Jesuit missionaries in this section because the first Jesuit headquarter in Asia was founded in 1542 at Goa, the capital of Portuguese India, by Francis Xavier (1506-1552) who also created the Society of Jesus along with Ignatius of Loyola (1491-1556). Xavier was invited to head the St. Paul's College in Goa, a pioneer seminary for the education of priests. In 1546, two Chinese boys became enrolled into St. Paul's College and one of them, known as Antonio, accompanied Xavier when he decided to start missionary work in China. Xavier could not enter the Chinese mainland and died in 1552. Thus China and India share the common experience of the encounter with Jesuit missionaries.

Ricci is also famous for the pioneer Jesuit priest who adopted the new strategy of their mission viz. "indigenization", who spoke and wrote Chinese and dressed like Confucian literati (Melvin et al. 2004: 46). In 1577, Ricci applied to be a member of a missionary to India and arrived in Goa next year. In 1582, he arrived at Macau where Portuguese traders first settled in the 16th century and subsequently administered the region until the handover in 1999. At the time, Christian missionary activity in China was almost exclusively limited to Macau, where quite a few local Chinese Christians who adapted themselves to Portuguese ways. It was the late 1570s that a Jesuit missionary Alessandro Valignano insisted on the "indigenization" approach. Accordingly Ricci started learning Chinese language and customs. Melvin says that instead of "Portugalizing" the Chinese by making converts assimilate to Portuguese customs and language, the Jesuit should "Sinicize" themselves (ibid.). The Portuguese-Chinese dictionary compiled by Ricci is the first ever European-Chinese dictionary.

After his long struggle to enter Beijing and to meet Emperor for getting permission to establish the Jesuit mission in the Capital city, Ricci was finally invited by the Wanli Emperor to become an advisor of the Imperial court in 1601. The Jesuit missionaries seem to regard musical instruments and their music as a useful and perfect gift. Keyboard instruments were particularly favorable because it was uncommon to Asian

³ Pope Pius XII modified his predecessor's decision in 1939.

countries and only one instrument was able to produce the perfect music. He established the Cathedral in Beijing and converted a number of Chinese officials to Christianity. He died in Beijing in 1610 at the age of 58.

Chinese culture was strongly intertwined with Confucian values and Ricci therefore decided to use Chinese concepts for explaining Christianity. But the Dominican and Franciscan missionaries opposed Ricci's strategy of "indigenization" and convinced the Vatican to outlaw Ricci's approach and to adopt the identification of European culture with Christianity. It caused the Chinese Rites Controversy which was related to larger controversies between the Dominicans and Jesuits over the adoption of local practices of other countries, such as the ascetic *brahman* practices of India, which I will take up later. Therefore Western music was performed in the court and churches however it remained as a mere entertainment for princely classes.

After Jesuit missionaries, it is important to refer that Protestants began entering China in 1807. Robert Morrison of the London Missionary Society produced a Chinese translation of the Bible and also compiled a Chinese dictionary for Westerners. The Protestant missionary activities increased after China lost the First Opium War (1839–1842). Then Under the protection of the Western powers, they went on to play a major role in the Westernization of China in the 19th and 20th centuries. The Taiping Rebellion (1850-1894) was connected in its origins to the influence of some missionaries.

The post Opium War era is said to mark a true start of the spread of Western music through the secular channel (ibid.: 84). Shanghai became a flourishing city of western culture in China with the foreign settlements. In the 19th century, the international attention to Shanghai grew due to its economic and trade potential. According to Treaties after the end of First Opium War, treaty ports including Shanghai were opened for international trade and foreign countries were allowed to visit and trade. In 1854, the Shanghai Municipal Council was created to manage the foreign settlements. By 1932, Shanghai had become the world's fifth largest city and the population of foreigners was about 70.000.

Shanghai Symphony Orchestra is an influential orchestra in China till today. It was founded in 1879 as Shanghai Public Band, one of the earliest orchestras in East Asia. It was renamed to Shanghai Municipal Council Symphony Orchestra (SMO) in 1922. Starting in 1919, an Italian pianist, Mario Paci, served as conductor for 23 years, expanded the ensemble into a full-scale orchestra. At first the members of SMO were foreigners only and Tan Shuzhen became the first Chinese who served as a violinist of SMO in 1927 (ibid.: 89-106). After the establishment of the People's Republic of China, SMO adopted its current name in 1956.

Another important institution is the Shanghai Conservatory of Music. It grew out of the Shanghai National Conservatory of Music established by Mr. Cai Yuanpei in 1927. Xiao Youmei who graduated the Leipzig Conservatory of Music was a director of the new school and curriculum. It was one of the first institutions of higher learning western music in China and many teaching staff came from Russia and France. It was renamed several times: National Training School of Music (1929), Branch of National Conservatory of Music (1943), Shanghai National Training School of Music (1945), Shanghai and Huadong Branches of Chinese Conservatory of Music (early 1950s). It adopted its current name in 1956.

The New Culture Movement of the 1910s and 1920s to lead a revolt against Confucian culture evoked the lasting interest in Western music. The followers of this movement called for the creation of a new Chinese culture based on global and Western standards, especially democracy and science. A number of Chinese musicians returned from studying abroad to perform Western classical music, composing works. Symphony orchestras were formed in most major cities. It is worth mentioning that Indian Nobel Laureate Rabindranath Tagore (1861-1941) held lectures in China in 1924 and argued detrimental effects which China would integrate much more Western civilization into Chinese society. Despite Tagore's lectures, two Western ideals, democracy and science rapidly gained support throughout China.

In 1942, Yan'an Talks on Literature and Art, a work by Mao Zedong (1893-1976) on the role of literature and art in the communist state, a large-scale campaign was launched to adapt folk music to create revolutionary songs for educating the illiterate rural population on party goals. One such example is *The East Is Red*, a folksong from northern Shaanxi that was the de facto anthem of the People's Republic of China during the Cultural Revolution in the 1960s⁴. Xian Xinghai (1905–1945), who was active during this period, composed *Yellow River Cantata* which became the most well-known of all of his works⁵.

The Chinese experiences on Western music seem to be apparently similar to Indian experiences: from the encounter with Jesuit missionaries to the colonial rule. Nevertheless it can be pointed out that there are several differences when we compare these two countries. First, Christianity had continuously existed even before the arrival of Jesuit missionary. Second, most of emperors or kings were generous to heathens and

⁴ The Chinese film *East Is Red* (1965) is directed by Wang Ping. It is a “song and dance epic” promoting Communism, especially the Maoism prevalent in the Communist Party of China in the early 1960s.

⁵ In late 1960s, it was adapted into a piano concerto entitled the *Yellow River Piano Concerto* by the pianist Yin Chengzong.

foreigners. Third, there was no movement such as the New Culture Movement in India that rather accepted the merit of “modernization” but avoided “westernization” as we can know from Tagore’s lectures. Accordingly Indian composers did not adopt eclectic methods for integrating Western music into Indian music. The Chinese eclectic methods in music can be analyzed better by the comparison with the cases of Russian musical nationalism. Then what is the cause of such different consequents despite the similarities in the process of social transformation? I will exploit this issue in following sections by focusing on Indian experiences.

4. The early Christian music in India

In the history of Christianity, the obvious difference between India and China is that the former has a continuity of Christian community for about 2000 years though the latter has a historical discrepancy between the ancient Nestorian and the medieval Jesuit. According to Indian Christian traditions, the apostle Thomas arrived in Kodungallur, Kerala in 52 AD to spread the gospel amongst Jewish settlements, and established the Seven Churches in present day Kerala and Tamil Nadu. According to legend, San Thome Basilica in Chennai is built over the site where St. Thomas is believed to be buried. The followers of St. Thomas are called St. Thomas Christians or Syrian Malabar Christians, or Nasranis.

According to historians, Bishop David of Basra sent as a missionary to India by around 300 AD. Thomas of Cana, a Mesopotamian merchant and missionary, brought a mission to India in 345 AD. He brought 400 Christians from Baghdad, to Kodungallur and asked refuge under the Chera (today’s Kerala) king from persecution of Christians by the Persian king Shapur II. The colony of Syrian Christians established at Kodungallur may be the first Christian community in South India for which there is a continuous written record. Accordingly Thomas of Cana might have been confused with the Apostle Thomas by Syrian Christians in India.

The Syrian Malabar Nasrani community was further strengthened by various Persian immigrants who settled there and Local rulers in Kerala gave the St. Thomas Christians various rights and privileges. This group who lived in Kerala peacefully for more than one thousand years started to suffer persecution from Portuguese in the 16th century. The Portuguese refused to accept the legitimate authority of the Indian hierarchy and its relation with the East Syrians. Jesuit Missionary, Francis Xavier is responsible for his role in initiating the Goa Inquisition and the persecution of heathens, and his destruction of native idols and temples. He noticed the newly converted

Christians were practicing their old customs and traditions. He requested the King of Portugal to establish the Inquisition in Goa in 1545 and said that there were many who lived according to the Jewish Law and according to the Mohammedan Sect, without any fear of God or shame of the World.

The Portuguese succeeded in appointing a Latin bishop to govern the Thomas Christians, and the local Christians' customs were officially anathematized. Archbishop of Goa imposed Latinizations in 1599. As all the texts of Syrian liturgy and traditions were burnt out, no record of their early rite and customs following to the East Syrian Rite have been available since then. The oppressive rule of the Portuguese provoked a violent reaction on the part of the indigenous Christian community. The first protest took place in 1653, known as the Koonan Kurishu Satyam. As a result, St. Thomas Christians got divided into two: The majority of St. Thomas Christians who accepted Latin rite are known as the Syro-Malabar Christians (Syro-Malabar Catholic Church) and the minority who refused to serve under the Jesuit established Syro-Malankara Rite (West Syrian Jacobite and Orthodox). The further divisions took place in the 18th century onwards, the present Nasranis are roughly divide into following groups:

- Assyrian Church of the East
 - Chaldean Syrian Church (East Syrian Rite)
- Eastern Catholic Churches:
 - Syro-Malabar Catholic Church (East Syrian Rite)
 - Syro-Malankara Catholic Church (West Syrian Rite)
- Oriental Orthodox:
 - Indian (Malankara) Orthodox Church (West Syrian Rite)
 - Jacobite Syrian Christian Church (West Syrian Rite)
- Independent:
 - Malankara Mar Thoma Syrian Church (West Syrian Rite)
 - Malabar Independent Syrian Church (West Syrian Rite)
 - St. Thomas Evangelical Church of India

Though Syrian is use of their liturgical language, the rite of St. Thomas Christians is the most indigenized among those of Indian Christians. They accommodated the way of worship and the manner of priests practiced in local Hindu temples into their rite. The structure of churches and its decoration resemble local Hindu temples. Today the music for their rite and worship is including diverse musical styles existing in India. Chanting prayers by priests in the Syrian Rite is musically monophony that keeps the

way of Syrian Orthodox though there are prayers in Malayalam (sometimes Sanskrit) which sounds like Hindu chants. Congregational songs in Malayalam (Sanskrit) are often composed in the call and response style of Hindu Bhajan (religious song). Malayalam devotional songs by solo and choir are composed in the popular Indian music style accompanied by both Indian and Western musical instruments (violin, keyboards, table, sitar and so on), some songs are highly westernized and the others are not. Thus such musical diversity and languages' diversity can be recognized even in Roman Catholic and protestant churches.

5. Jesuit Missionaries and Music

Goa had been the Portuguese overseas territory in India that existed for about 450 years until it was annexed by India in 1961. The Portuguese first reached the west coast of India when Vasco da Gama landed at Calicut in 1498 and Afonso de Albuquerque conquered Goa in 1510 and made it their headquarters since 1530. Catholic missionary activities soon followed. Under the Portuguese rule, Goan indigenous population converted to Christianity at a large scale. After conversion, locals were usually granted Portuguese citizenship. Thus Goa became the center of Christianization in the East. The contemporary Goan Catholics are descendants of the native Brahmans and Kshatriyas converted from Hinduism and an ethno-religious community of Roman Catholics who speak the Konkani language.

The Portuguese missionaries who accompanied the conquerors were the Franciscans, Jesuits, Dominicans, and Augustinians. They first reached the Malabar Coast in the late 15th century. They made contact with the St. Thomas Christians and sought to introduce the Catholicism among them. Missionaries of the newly-founded Society of Jesus led by Francis Xavier were sent to Goa; the Portuguese colonial government supported them. They offered rice donations for the poor, good positions in the Portuguese colonies for the middle class, and military support for local rulers. Many Indians were converted opportunistic Rice Christians who continued to practice their religious tradition. The Portuguese insisted that the converts should avoid anything Hindu and should adopt foreign food habits and dress though Konkani Christians wanted to preserve their language, culture and manners. The colonizers imposed excessive taxes on the native Christians.

Thus imposing the colonial policies, viz. Portugalizations in customs and Latinizations in Christian Rite, and remaining as a colony of Portugal caused Goan culture to be highly westernized. It is possible to compare with the case of Macau which

had also remained as another colony of Portugal in Asia. These different experiences from the rest of India made Goan music so unique. The Christian hymns translated into Konkani from the Latin hymns and Konkani hymns composed by Goan Catholic were still performed. Not only religious music but also folk and popular music received Portuguese influences. Mando is a dance music evolved during the 19th and 20th century among Goan Catholics which represents the both Indian and western musical traditions. Deknni is a semi-classical dance form which might have been originated in the Hindu musical tradition though it is popular among Goan Catholic. The ghumot, a musical instrument made by an earthen pot is used while performing the Mando and other music especially for weddings along with Western musical instruments such as the guitar, the bass and the keyboard.

On the other hand, Roberto de Nobili (1577-1656), an Italian Jesuit missionary to Southern India, adopted another strategy of accommodating local Hindu customs, viz. “indigenization” to preach Christianity, that were, in his view, not contrary to Christianity. He arrived in Goa in 1605 and then settled in Madurai in 1606. Studying Sanskrit and Tamil literature through a Hindu scholar, he approached high caste people and engaged in dialogue with Hindu scholars on the truths of Christianity. He called himself a “Tattuva Bhodini (teacher of wisdom)” and began to conduct himself like a Sannyasin. Adopting a Hindu custom of shaving his head and keeping only a tiny tuft, he wore white dhoti and wooden sandals, and three-stringed thread across the chest which he interpreted as representing the Holy Trinity, Father, Son and Holy Spirit. He certainly was one of the first Europeans to gain a deeper understanding of Sanskrit and Tamil.

His strategy raised a fierce controversy among his fellow Jesuits and with the Archbishop of Goa. The dispute was settled by Pope Gregory XV in 1623. The customs of the three-stringed thread, the tuft, the use of sandalwood paste on the forehead and baths were allowed, inasmuch they did not imply any superstitious ritual. The Pope invited also the Indian neophytes to overcome their caste sensitivity and their discrimination against the pariahs. De Nobili died in Mylapore in 1656 at the age of 79.

Contrary to Xavier who initiated “Latenization”, de Nobili’s approach was apparently similar to Matteo Rich who adopted the same strategy in China. But in the former case, indigenization had already existed among St. Thomas Christians for a long time before the arrival of Portuguese. Accordingly the controversy over the strategy of “indigenization” occurred even inside Jesuit missionary whose real opponents were indigenized St. Thomas Christians. In the latter case, the controversy occurred mainly between Dominicans and Jesuits. As de Nobili had been carrying on his mission not in

Goa under the Portuguese rule but in Madurai under the native rule, the Catholic rite outside Goa seems to have been much more indigenized than that of Goa.

6. Christian Music under the British Raj

The interactions on music between Europeans and natives from the late 18th century to the early 20th century, Protestant missionaries, British residents and officials, native Christians, and Hindu rulers and musicians have been already described in my previous two papers. Therefore I will just summarize topic of these papers.

In my first paper on this topic, “The Reception of Western Music in South India around 1800” (Inoue 2010a), I focused on the Western music appreciated by Indians in South India around 1800. At the almost same period, Hindustani air, Indian melodies collected by Europeans to be arranged for the accompaniment by Western musical instruments, sometimes with English lyrics, was flourishing in Calcutta (now Kolkata). I particularly concentrated on analyzing the contribution of Serfoji II (reign: 1798-1832), then Maratha King of Thanjavur, who is said to have been the first Indian composer appropriating Western styles. He established the Tanjore (Thanjavur) Band, a military band, attached to his palace and composed music for the band.

Serfoji II had a close friendship with Christian missionaries who introduced him to Western learning and culture that made him grow his knowledge of Western music. Friedrich Schwartz (1726-1798), a German Protestant missionary was the most important personality among them. Having learnt Tamil to assist in a translation of the Bible, Schwartz decided to be a missionary to India. He arrived in India in 1750 and made a friendship with Tulaja II in 1769. Shortly before his death Tulaja II committed to Schwartz the education of his adopted son and successor (Figure 4). Schwartz taught the prince Serfoji along with another pupil Vedanayakam Sastiriyar (1774-1864), a Tamil Christian. Vedanayakam was a proficient poet / lyricist who left over 500 lyrics and 133 books.

I also referred other examples of the Western impact on Indian music of the same period: *Nottusvara Sahitya*, an example of Indian reconstruction of Western music, composed by Muttusvami Dikshitar (1775-1835), one of the musical trinity of Carnatic music (South Indian classical music), that can be regarded as a counter-specimen of Hindustani air. I also discussed on the adaptation of violin as an indispensable instrument for Carnatic music today.

As concluding remarks, I answered the following questions: what is the implication of Serfoji II's positive approach to Western music, and why he show his keen

interest in Western culture and learning, and how we can interpret his ambiguous attitude between the native and the British. Serfoji II lived in the transitional period from the native rule to the British Raj. He lost his political power as his throne could be retained only with the permission given by the Governor of Madras. On the other hand, most Europeans who visited Thanjavur Palace paid their homage to Serfoji II and admired his knowledge and learning, that is proved from several accounts on him written by those foreign visitors and residents. Instead, Serfoji II seems to have acted as a good friend of the British. We should, however, not forget that Serfoji II was a generous patron of both native and Western culture as his ancestral rulers were. He did not convert to Christianity but remained to be a staunch Hindu.

It was in the period of Serfoji II that the officially institutionalized Orientalism of the Asiatic Society of Bengal was set up by William Jones (1746-94) at Calcutta. Serfoji II's attitude can be taken as neither a simple kind of reaction or answer to the colonial discourse nor a kind of negotiation with the colonial policy "divide and rule". Rather, it is a process that the native constructs the British as the exotic "Other" during the period of first colonial encounter. Serfoji II tried to obtain Western knowledge similar to Orientalists' pursuit of indigenous knowledge. Both native and colonial ways of practice in those days were empirical and experimental as depending on indigenous or imported texts and on native or colonial informants as the "Other".

Serfoji II did not share the same works of the great composers in the conventional history of Western music but he shared the rather popular works of those days in England. As the informants existing around him were British officials, residents, missionaries, and the Governor's band, Serfoji II got more familiar with military band music. That is why he himself organized and instructed the military band attached to his Palace and made the band play conventional British military music and his compositions. I also said that *Nottusvara Sahitya* was a counterpart of Hindustani Air which was a Western reconstruction of Indian music as it can be regarded as an Indian reconstruction of Western music. Meantime, the violin had been totally indigenized by its tuning, playing techniques and the way of holding it. It is also important to point out that Western major scale and simple beats (3 or 4 beats) was a typical Indian understanding of Western music which might cause to strengthen the Indian perception of complexity of their indigenous music.

In my second paper, "Interactions between Missionaries and Native Christians on Music in South India: Constructing Hindu-Christian Identity," (Inoue 2010b) I tried to construct an alternative history of Carnatic music in which non-Brahman, Tamil-speaking native Christians were active. The history and development of Carnatic

music (South Indian classical music) is usually constructed along with the Hindu religious tradition. According to this type of historiography, the time that Carnatic music was flourished under the Thanjavur Maratha rule is regarded as the golden era. Tyagaraja (1767-1847), Muttuswami Dikshitar (1775-1835), and Syama Sastri (1762-1827), so called the Trinity of Carnatic music, belong to this period. They composed their musical works either in Telugu used as an official language of the Nayakas (local rulers after the Vijayanagara Empire) till the Maratha rule had commenced, or in Sanskrit, a literary language used by Brahmans. They hardly used Tamil, a local language of this region, for their compositions since they were all Brahmans more or less patronized by the Thanjavur Court. The lack of the Tamil repertoires in Carnatic music caused the Tamil Isai (music) movement, propagating Tamil songs in the beginning of 1940s. But we should consider that this type of the history of Carnatic music might have been reconstructed in the nationalist line promoted by the dominant Hindu leaders against the British rule.

For this purpose, I took four distinguished native Christians as examples, Vedanayagam (Pillai) Sastiriyar (1774-1864), Mayuram Vedanayagam Pillai (1826-89), A. M. Chinnaswami Mudaliyar (1813-1901), and Abraham Pandithar (1859-1919). Though their activities were various: Sastiriyar propagated his evangelical thought through his compositions, Vedanayagam Pillai did not praise any personal God but composed songs to describe omnipresence and omnipotence of the Creator of the whole Universe, Chinnaswami published periodicals on Carnatic music in staff notation for promoting Indian music to Westerners, and Pandithar organized music conferences and propagating the importance of scientific research on music, all of them contributed for the development and transformation of South Indian classical music by both theoretical and practical ways in the transitional period from the native rule to the British Raj.

It is also important to point out that their activities were caused by interactions with Christian missionaries, British residents and officials, different from the musical trinity of Carnatic music who were closely related with native rulers. I discussed the way of constructing their identity between Hindu and Christian and its characteristics through music used as a media of their expression.

As concluding remarks, I interpreted differences of their approach to music as follows: the purpose of Vedanayagam Sastiriyar was promoting evangelical thought through music, Vedanayagam Pillai intended to be secular by not addressing any personal god, Chinnaswami Mudaliyar tried preserving and promoting music of his time, and Abraham Pandithar constructed the great history of Tamils and Tamil Isai (music). Though there were above differences in their approach and intention, their

strategic use of dichotomous categories, viz. Hindu / Christian, Indian / European, Brahman / Non-Brahman, Upper / Lower caste etc., were common to all of them. Thus they were expressing themselves through music as a powerful cultural media and constructing their identities between the colonizer and the colonized.

Finally I raised the following questions on the basic dichotomy, viz. the conventional historiography and alternative historiography: who wrote the historiography and why, and who read the historiography and why. It is important to find the answers of these questions when we take up the problematic and controversial historiography as a topic.

In India, there has been no movement of Westernization which can be found in the New Culture Movement of China. As I said before, Rabindranath Tagore delivered lectures in China warning the detrimental effects of rapid Westernization. The colonization by British and founding of the Indian Empire in the mid-19th century and soon after the rise of nationalist movement against British rule might have prevented Westernization spreading. Consequently, Indian musicians and scholars hardly learned European classical music; instead, they adhered to keep Indian musical tradition as spiritually and scientifically high as European classical music.

7. Concluding Remarks: Christian Music after the Independence

In this paper I tried to interpret Western impacts on music in Russia, China and India through describing both European missionaries and native Christians as intermediary actors in the contact zone. My final question is what is the most characteristic of Christian music of India by comparison with Russian and Chinese experiences.

The Second Vatican Council was convoked by Pope John XXIII to “open up the windows and let the fresh air in.” The document issued in 1963 says that Church approves of all art which can be best used for the liturgy, allows the use of the vernacular in Mass and sacraments, and even encourages the use of the vernacular in the readings and common prayer. Accordingly, music of the native people is adapted to use for the liturgy of churches and missionaries have been encouraged learning indigenous musical traditions. No prohibition is imposed upon musical styles used in liturgy (Duncan 1999: 5-7).

In India, this decision brought a great change of Christian music. The Catholic Bishop’s Conference of India was established in April, 1964 and the Liturgical Commission and the National Centre for Catechetics and Liturgy in Bangalore were established at the General Meeting held in October, 1966 at New Delhi. In 1968, the

Sub-commission for music discussed how vernacular language and indigenous music can be adapted to the liturgical process. It is worth pointing that bishops did not enforce a particular style of music on any community and rather allowed the use of indigenous music and musical instruments for the help of the local community (ibid.: 9-11). After the Second Vatican Council, a number of bishops started learning either Hindustani or Carnatic music intensively and composing devotional songs in which the popular styles of Hindu devotional song called *bhajan* and *kirtana* are preferred by them. These songs were recorded and CDs and Cassettes are sold widely.

Today, Christian music of India extremely varies both in musical forms and in languages. When we visit major churches located in the metropolitan city such as Bangalore, Chennai, Panaji and else, there are masses held particularly on festival days in various languages: English, Kannada, Malayalam, Telugu, Tamil, and Hindi are used in Bangalore and Chennai, while English, Portuguese, Konkani, Marathi, Hindi, and Kannada are used in Panaji and so on. The music performed by the choir and both prayers and hymns by the bishop and congregation vary accordance with their language used, even from one church to another. The English devotional songs sung in the English mass are famous even in Japan by its Japanese translation. Such an extreme variety can be observed neither in Russian Orthodox nor in China. I assume that this is the most characteristic feature of Christian music of India.

References:

- American Sunday-School Union ed. 1830 *The Life of Christian F. Swartz*. Reprinted in 2009, General Books.
- Anthonymsamy, S. J. 2004 *A Saga of Faith: St. Thomas, the Apostle of India*. Chennai: National Shrine of St. Thomas Basilica.
- Barboza, Francis Peter, 1990 *Christianity in Indian Dance Forms*. Delhi: Sri Satguru Publicaions.
- Beach, Harlan Page, 1904 *India and Christian Opportunity*. Reprinted in 2009, General Books, Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions.
- Books LLC ed. 2010 *Christian Communities of India: Mangalorean Catholics, Goan Catholics, Syrian Malabar Nasrani, East Indians, Roman Catholic Brahmin, Marathi Christians, List of Syro-Malabar Catholics, Karwari Catholics, Mangalorean Protestants*. Tennessee.
- Books LLC ed. 2010 *Christian Denominations in India: Mar Thoma Church, Syro-Malankara Catholic Church, Syro-Malabar Cholic Church, Malankara Church,*

- Timeline of the Syro-Malabar Cholic Church, Church of South India, Malabar Independent Syrian Church, Jacobite Syrian Christian Church.* Tennessee.
- Books LLC ed. 2010 *Universities and Colleges in India by Religious Affiliation: Christian Universities and Colleges in India, Hindu Universities and Colleges, Islamic Universities and Colleges in India, Aligarh Muslim University, Scottish Church College, Calcutta, Jamia Millia Islamia, Andhra Christian Theological College.* Tennessee.
- Brown, Judith M. and Robert Eric Frykenberg eds. 2002 *Christians, Cultural Interactions, and India's Religious Traditions.* Grand Rapids and Cambridge: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing.
- Charles, G. 2009 *Daily Mass Hand Book December 2010.* Chennai: Annai Vailankanni Bible Centre.
- Christian Literature Society for India ed. 1895 *History of Christianity in India: With Its Prospects.* Reprinted, Kessinger Legacy Reprints, Madras.
- Christian Literature Society for India ed. 1900 *India Hindu and India Christian: Or, What Hinduism Has Done for India, and, What Christianity Would Do for It: an Appeal to Thoughtful Hindus.* Reprinted, General Books, London.
- Collins, Paul M. 2007 *Christian Inculturation in India.* Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing.
- D'Souza, Herman, 2009 *In the Steps of St. Thomas.* 1st edition in 1952, 5th edition, Madras: Disciples of St. Thomas.
- Duncan, Stephen F. 1999 *A Genre in Hindusthani Music (Bhajans) as Used in the Catholic Church.* Lewiston, Queenston, Lampeter: The Edwin Mellen Press.
- Das, Somen, 1994 *Christian Ethics and Indian Ethos.* 1st Published in 1989, Revised and Expanded Edition, Delhi: I.S.P.C.K.
- Dickinson, Richard D. N. 1971 *The Christian College in Developing India: A Sociological Inquiry.* Madras: Oxford University Press.
- Frykenberg, Robert Erick ed. 2003 *Christians and Missionaries in India: Cross-Cultural Communication since 1500.* Grand Rapids and Cambridge: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing.
- Hudson, D. Dennis, 2000 *Protestant Origins in India: Tamil Evangelical Christians, 1706-1835.* Cambridge: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, Richmond: Curzon Press.
- Inoue, Takako, 2010a "The Reception of Western Music in South India around 1800", Unpublished Paper, 2010 Summer International Symposium on "Orient on Orient: Images of Asia in Eurasian Countries", July7-9, 2010, Slavic Research Center, Hokkaido University.

- Inoue, Takako, 2010b “Interactions between Missionaries and Native Christians on Music in South India: Constructing Hindu-Christian Identity.” Unpublished Paper, International Conference on “Religion and Media: Transcultural Perspective”, November 2-3, 2010, Friedrich–Alexander University, Erlangen-Nurnberg.
- Johnston, Anna, 2003 *Missionary Writing and Empire, 1800-1860*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kariyil, Antony, 1995 *Church and Society in Kerala: A Sociological Study*. New Delhi: Intercultural Publications.
- Kraus, Richard Curt, 1989 *Pianos and Politics in China: Middle-Class Ambitions and the Struggle over Western Music*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Lakshmi Bay, I. K. and Renuka Suresh, 2008 *Kilittava Tamilicai Pōdiṇi*. Chennai: Authors.
- Liebau, Herausgegeben von Heike, Andreas Nehring and Brigitte Klosterberg, 2010 *Mission und Forschung: Translokale Wissensproduktion zwischen Indien und Europa im 18. und 19. Jahrhundert*. Halle: Franckeschen Stiftungen.
- Maes, Francis, 2002 *A History of Russian Music: From Kamarinskaya to Babi Yar*. Originally Published in 1996, Translated by Arnold J. Pomerans and Erica Pomerans, Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Mallmpalli, Chandra, 2004 *Christians and Public Life in Colonial South India, 1863-1937: Contending with Marginality*. London: Routledge Curzon.
- Mathew, A. 1988 *Christian Missions, Education and Nationalism: From Dominance to Compromise 1870-1930*. Delhi: Anamika Prakashan.
- Melvin, Sheila, and Jindong Cai, 2004 *Rhapsody in Red: How Western Classical Music Became Chinese*. New York: Algora Publishing.
- Oddie, Geoffrey A. 1991 *Hindu and Christian in South-East India*. London: Curzon Press, Wellesley Hills: The Riverdale Company.
- Page, Jesse, 1921 *Schwartz of Tanjore*. Reprinted, Cornell University Library Digital Collections, London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge.
- Pattaparambil, Antoney George, 2007 *The Failed Rebellion of Syro-Malabar Christians: A Historiographical Analysis of the Contributions of Paulinus of St. Bartholomew*. Roma: Author.
- Pereira, José, and Micael Martins, 2000 *Song of Goa: Mandos of Yearning*. New Delhi: Aryan Books International.
- Pratt, Mary Louise 1991 “Arts of the Contact Zone,” *Profession* 91. New York: MLA, 33-40.
- Raju, S. Balachandra and Padmini Raju, 2000 *Karṇāṭaka Icaiyil Kilittavap Pāṭalkaḷ*.

- Chennai: Sivaranjani Publications.
- Schouten, Jan Peter, 2008 *Jesus as Guru: The Image of Christ among Hindus and Christians in India*. Amsterdam, New York: Editions Rodopi.
- Swartz, Christian Frederick, 1826 *Remains of the Rev. C.f. Schwartz, Missionary in India, Consisting of His Letters and Journals: With a Sketch of His Life*. Reprinted in 2010, General Books, London: Jaques and Weight.
- Schwartz, Christian Friedrich, n.d. (1796) *Defence of Missions in India, by the Late Venerable Mr. Swartz, Published by the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, in Their Report for 1795*. Reprinted, ECCO Print Editions, London: H. Bryer.
- Shourie, Arun, 1994 *Missionaries in India: Continuities, Changes, Dilemmas*. New Delhi: ASA Publications.
- Studdert- Kennedy, Gerald, 1991 *British Christians, Indian Nationalists and the Raj*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- 杉本義男編 2006 『キリスト教と文明化の人類学的研究』国立民族学博物館。
- Storow, Edward, n.d. (before 1923) *India and Christian Missions*. London: John Snow.
- Swartz, Christian Frederick, and Hugh Pearson, 1835 *Memoirs of the Life and Correspondence of the Rev. Christian Frederick Swartz: To Which Is Prefixed a Sketch of the History of Christianity in India*. Reprinted, London: J. Hatchard and Son.
- Thekkedath, Joseph, 1982 *History of Christianity in India Volume II: From the Middle of the Sixteenth to the End of the Seventeenth Century (1542-1700)*. Bangalore: The Church History Association of India.
- Ward, Ferdinand De Wilton, 1850 *India and the Hindoos: With an Account of Christian Missions among Them*. Reprinted in 2009, General Books, Baker and Scribner.
- Wesley, Arun Kumar, 2002 *Liturgy as Worship: Towards a Form of Worship in Song, Word and Drama*. Bangalore: Asian Trading Corporation.